

3

COMMONALITIES AND DIFFERENCES: TRANSFORMATIONAL AND TRANSFORMATIVE LEARNING



Definitions and Conceptualizations of Transformative Learning

Pennington et al., (2013) : “Transdisciplinary, transformative research encompasses teams with a shared commitment to finding a solution to the problem; deep knowledge in different fields of expertise; a shared ethical and value system for collaborative engagement within the research team; a position within highly connected knowledge networks; and institutional access to the required funding, material, experimental, and technological resources” (p. 8).

[Pennington \(2013\) Transformative Research, Transformative Learning](#)

APA Citation: Pennington, Simpson, G. L., McConnell, M. S., Fair, J. M., & Baker, R. J. (2013). Transdisciplinary Research, Transformative Learning, and Transformative Science. *Bioscience*, 63(7), 564–573. <https://doi.org/10.1525/bio.2013.63.7.9>

Dal Magro et al., (2020). “Transformative learning is an experiential educational strategy that incorporates interactive methods of teaching and learning... so that power is shared between instructors and students” (p. 582)

[Dal Magro et al., \(2020\) Enriching the Intersection of Service and Transformative Learning ...](#)

APA Citation: Dal Magro, Pozzebon, M., & Schutel, S. (2020). Enriching the intersection of service and transformative learning with Freirean ideas: The case of a critical experiential learning programme in Brazil. *Management Learning*, 51(5), 579–597. <https://doi.org/10.1177/1350507620908607>

Hogan (2016): Emphasized the relationship between learning practices and cognitive development ; connectin between education and making differences in lives and world outcomes; Impact of education upon individual development and social change; reality that education is a tool for social change and proscial human development. Quantitative conclusions about the role of education and cognitive, affective, and behavioral development of adult learners

[Hogan 2016 TLT as an Analytic Metatheory](#)

APA Citation: Hoggan. (2016). Transformative learning as a metatheory: Definition, criteria, and typology. *Adult Education Quarterly*, 66(1), 57–75. <https://doi.org/10.1177/0741713615611216>

Murdoch et al., (2020): Transformative Learning is defined by mutual reciprocity and valuation of differences between teacher–students as evidenced by the quality of openness and relational and instructional contexts in classrooms; endorsement of social change and equity in education and beyond; and embracement of inclusive instructional and social practices

[Murdoch 2020 Feeling Heard Inclusive Education..](#)



Definitions and Conceptualizations of Transformative Learning

APA Citation: Murdoch, English, A. R., Hintz, A., & Tyson, K. (2020). Feeling heard: Inclusive education, transformative learning, and productive struggle. *Educational Theory*, 70(5), 653–679. <https://doi.org/10.1111/edth.12449>

Cox (2021) utilized recurring concepts across the literature to construct five subscales to measure transformative learning: “transformative outcomes, social support, self-directed learning (which was later excluded), attitude toward uncertainty, and criticality, which encompasses critical reflection” (p. 385).

Cox 2021 Grounding Transformative Learning Through Assessment TROPOS

Kim (2020): Specific individual and organizational contexts facilitate leadership development for school principals as “adult learners” (1) using both active and interactive learning processes; (2) linking concrete and real-life experiences to new knowledge; (3) taking into account learners’ diversity of learning styles and backgrounds; (4) giving adult learners’ autonomy over deciding learning goals and processes; and (5) creating environments to facilitate deep learning” (p.356). Qualitative analysis, five major categories: “disorienting dilemmas, critical reflection, self-awareness as a leader, setting key assumptions for leadership practices, and developing leadership strategies” (p. 361). Qualitative analysis identified subcategories that proved transformational learning involves long-standing changes at cognitive and behavioral levels: “developing leadership strategies; knowing others better, building capacity of community, and listening to others to make better decisions” (p. 361).

[Kim \(2020\) Becoming Successful Leaders](#)

Wiley et al., (2021) quantitative findings proved consistency and correlation between Hoggan’s (2016) typology of TL and TL constructs identified by the Beliefs, Events, and Values Inventory (BEVI). Hoggan’s Typology of TL encompassed the following constructs “Worldview: Change in underlying worldview assumptions or conceptualizations; Epistemology:

Changes in epistemic beliefs, More autonomous, systemic, authentic, or embodied ways of knowing; Capacity:

Development of cognitive abilities - Consciousness; Self:

Outcomes of self, Changes in one’s sense of identity,

Relatedness to others; Self-efficacy - Empowerment; Ontology: Affective experience, Ways of being,

Mindful awareness/presence in the moment, Dialogue with the

unconscious; and Behavior/action - Change in

observable behavior” (p. 409). Constructs for TL according to the BEVI: sociocultural openness; religious

traditionalism; gender traditionalism; ecological resonance; global resonance; basic determinism;

socioemotional convergence; self-efficacy; self-awareness; self-awareness; meaning quest; needs

closure; needs fulfillment; identity diffusion; basic openness; self-awareness; meaning quest; physical

resonance; and emotional attunement (not measured) (pp. 408-409)

[Wiley et al., \(2021\) A New Depth-Based Quantitative Approach to Assessing Transformative Learning](#)

Definitions and Conceptualizations of Transformational Learning

Transformational Learning Theory promotes socialized learning and mediation. Organizational, perceptual, and behavioral changes created and sustained prosocial change processes in academia, worldwide governments, and diverse business and industries. Additional dimensions of TLT promoted sustainable and inclusive change processes as follows: (1) inclusion of role-playing to advance student empathy and identity; (2) stimulation of real-world problems toward ethical and effective courses of action; (3) acquisition of essential disciplinary knowledge and professional skills; (4) evaluation of academic objectives and professional competencies relative to emergent professional roles and networking opportunities; and (5) sociocognitive transformations as evidenced by living, working, relating, and valuing others – authentically and empathetically (Brock et al., 2012).

[Brock \(2012\) Tools for Change An Examination of TL](#)

Brock, S., Florescu, I., & Teran, L. (2012). Tools for change: An examination of transformative learning and its precursor steps in undergraduate students, International Scholarly Research Network, 1–5, doi:10.5402/2012/234125

Ladson-Billings argued integration of CRP actively addresses “[outstanding] educational debts” as unequal access to high-quality public and higher educational practices and institutions (p. 107). Secondly, integration of CRP actively addresses “[outstanding] sociopolitical debts [as denial] of self-determination” for racial, ethnic, and social minorities in America due to Westernized values, beliefs, and laws (p.108). Thirdly, integration of CRP reacts to generational gaps between educators and students by incorporating lessons learned and evaluating ideologies espoused by hip-hop pedagogy. Integration of CRP also embraces use of emergent advancements in information, technology, and communication systems worldwide to teach, mentor, and empower P-12 students and undergraduates across sociocultural differences. Most importantly, integration of CRP requires educators to respond ethically, empathetically, and respectfully to boons in student diversity by creating sustaining inclusive instructional and assessment practices to empower diverse P-12 student populations.

[Ladson Billings \(2013\) Stakes is High Educating new century students](#)

Ladson-Billings, G. (2013). Stakes is high educating new century students. *The Journal of Negro Education*, 82 (2), 105–110.

Comparatively, Williams’ (2009) longitudinal study explored the impact of the researcher’s dramaturgical conceptualization of TLT. This conceptualization illustrated the ill effects of cultural assimilation upon persons of color in America. Williams referenced historical and social movements which underscored the ill effects of Western philosophies in public and higher education. Williams’ Theatre of Oppression (TO) emphasized liberatory, multicultural, and diversity tenets of TLT. Williams’ study encompassed disparate, urban learning communities and institutions in New Jersey, Massachusetts, and New York. Through various artistic and cultural mediums, issues of race, gender, class, sexual orientation, and power and privilege imbalances produced gains in intercultural awareness, knowledge, and relationships between educators and their students. However, nonparticipating educators and leaders labeled participating educators and students as troublemakers because they did not confirm to traditionalist or Westernized approaches to teaching and learning

3

COMMONALITIES AND DIFFERENCES: TRANSFORMATIONAL AND TRANSFORMATIVE LEARNING



Definitions and Conceptualizations of Transformational Learning (cont'd)

[Williams, H.S. \(2019\) Black Mama Sauce Embedded Transformative Education](#)

Williams, H.S. (2009). Black Mama Sauce: Embodied transformative education. *Counterpoints—Innovations in transformative learning: Space, Culture, and the Arts*, 341, 269–286. <https://www.jstor.org/stable/42980311>

Differences between Transformative Learning and Transformational Learning

- Transformational Learning Theory (Mezirow, 1982) is a foundational construct for Transformative Learning Theory
- Introduction of new lexicon concerning the fight for equity, diversity, and inclusiveness in education
- Transformative learning is a social and instructional pedagogy with developing constructs and studies impacting educational and instructional leadership.

Commonalities between Transformative Learning and Transformational Learning

- Transformative learning is a derivative of Mezirow's Transformational Learning Theory
- Progressive in nature regarding diversity as cultural, social, and linguistic in nature
- Humanistic and systemic approaches to equity, diversity, and inclusion in educational and instructional leadership
- Example: Quennerstedt (2019) referenced theorist: John Dewey – efficacy in education requires rigorous and meaningful, social interactions. Also, schools must be considered as social institutions which impact individual development
- Both emphasize equity, diversity, and inclusiveness in educational and instructional leadership as well as in assessment practices in public and higher education
- Emphasize global and interpersonal implications of safeguarding equity, diversity, and inclusiveness in public and higher education

[Quennerstedt \(2019\) Physical Education and the Art of Teaching: Transformative Learning and Teaching..](#)

APA Citation: Quennerstedt. (2019). Physical education and the art of teaching: transformative learning and teaching in physical education and sports pedagogy. *Publikationer Från Örebro Universitet*, 24(6), 611–623. <https://doi.org/10.1080/13573322.2019.1574731>

3

COMMONALITIES AND DIFFERENCES: TRANSFORMATIONAL AND TRANSFORMATIVE LEARNING



Strategies and Insights for Sustaining Transformative and Transformational Learning

Turner (2018) upheld transformational learning theory to sustain equitable and inclusive education by incorporating fictional, historical, and mythical traditions, symbols, and other imagery to gauge K-12 students' sense-making relative to modern-day challenges and opportunities which influence their perception and valuation of others. Turner incorporated character education as an inclusive pedagogy to teach inclusively and optimize teaching efficacy in alignment with the prescribed curriculum and student learning outcomes.

APA Citation: Turner, T.N. (2018). Character education: The pathway to citizenship: Teaching in an interconnected world, In J. Clabough & T. Litner (Eds.), *No reluctant citizens: Teaching civics in K-12 classrooms* (pp. 23–36). Information Age Publishing.

Harshman and Darby (2018) integrated tenets of Critical Race Theory (CRT) and Culturally Responsive Pedagogy (CRP) to teach fifth-grade history. The experts created and implemented an anti-racist research project within a suburban school striving for transformational social progress in relation to historic and modern-day wrongs impacting students of color and their families.

APA Citation: Harshman, J. & Darby, L (2018). The Lemme History Detectives: Researching rights, race, and activism within local history. In J. Clabough & T. Litner (Eds.). *No reluctant citizens: Teaching civics in K-12 classrooms* (pp. 53–66). Information Age Publishing Inc.

Shannon-Baker (2019) demonstrated what inclusive assessment practices look like in practice relative to preservice teachers' evaluation of student learning artifacts. During a one-semester diversity course, Shannon-Baker developed structured lectures, reflective journaling, and project-based learning to introduce multicultural education, while teaching at a predominately white institution for female scholars. Twenty-five participants ranged in age, student classification, and major wherein "15 self-identified as students of color: and others self-identified as working class, first-generation college students, and [as belonging to the LGBTQ community]" (p. 51). For this study, culturally relevant pedagogy (CRP) served as a pedagogical framework. Shannon-Baker (2018) substantiated globally incompetent preservice teachers negatively impact the teaching and learning continuum. For example, preservice teachers failed to understand that "[teaching] only Western ways of knowing" lead to alienation and marginalization of diverse P-12 populations with unique learning preferences, needs, interests, and contributions (p. 58).

[Shannon-Baker 2018 A Multicultural Praxis](#)

APA: Citation: Shannon-Baker. (2018). A Multicultural Education Praxis: Integrating Past and Present, Living Theories, and Practice. *International Journal of Multicultural Education*, 20(1), 48–66. <https://doi.org/10.18251/ijme.v20i1.1518>

3

COMMONALITIES AND DIFFERENCES: TRANSFORMATIONAL AND TRANSFORMATIVE LEARNING



Strategies and Insights for Sustaining Transformative and Transformational Learning (cont'd)

Page et al. (2019) explored the impact of “Indigenous graduate curriculum development” upon educators who attended The University of Technology–Sydney (UTS). The UTS Framework for global competency integration comprised three programmatic goals: examination of trends, challenges and issues impacting teacher education; understanding and actualizing educators’ role in global and cultural engagement in classrooms and beyond; and maximizing best practices to teach disciplinary knowledge and global competencies to graduate-level educators. This model produced desired knowledge, skills, attributes, attitudes, and values among educators. Inclusion of TLT tenets transformed undergraduates’ values and belief systems. Purposeful immersion of educators in intercultural exchanges and relations and creation of experiential learning opportunities facilitated educators’ awareness and propensity to assess local, national, and global needs in respect to “social justice and inclusiveness” in academic and beyond (p. 5).

[Page et al., \(2019\) Creating a Degree-Focused Pedagogical Framework](#)

APA Citation: Page, Trudgett, M., & Bodkin-Andrews, G. (2019). Creating a degree-focused pedagogical framework to guide Indigenous graduate attribute curriculum development. *Higher Education*, 78(1), 1–15. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s10734-018-0324-4>

Via a case study about two kindergarten classes, Yang and Li (2019) investigated the impact of modern-day reforms in school-based curriculums relative to Chinese kindergarten education. These experts found China’s school-based curriculums adopted Western models of public-school education. Within these learning environments, “a hybrid of traditional, Chinese and Western cultures” emerged and did not represent the racial identities, interests, and contributions of the represented student population (p. 280).

[Yang & Li \(2019\) Changing Culture, Changing Curriculum](#)

APA Citation: Yang, & Li, H. (2019). Changing culture, changing curriculum: a case study of early childhood curriculum innovations in two Chinese kindergartens. *Curriculum Journal (London, England)*, 30(3), 279–297. <https://doi.org/10.1080/09585176.2019.1568269>



EPI Pathways



EPIPathways



epipathways.org

U VOORHEES
UNIVERSITY